In Defense of Gaza's Hospitals: An Urgent Appeal for Protection Amidst Ongoing Attacks Against Gaza's Healthcare System

Joint Statement by Members of the Rebuilding Gaza's Health Sector Initiative Endorsed by: [Insert organization names]...

Statement Written by: Maya Hatoum, Michelle Nemati April 2nd, 2024

The reported indiscriminate attacks and bombardment of Gaza's hospitals by the Israeli Defense Forces (IDF) has caused a complete collapse of the healthcare system and overwhelming disparity of access to healthcare services, with only 10 out of 36 hospitals as partially functioning to date. The reportedly deliberate targeting of medical hospitals and clinics is not only morally reprehensible but is also a clear violation of international humanitarian law (IHL) under Article 19 outlined in the Geneva Conventions.

Investigations by humanitarian organizations on the IDF's claims to target Hamas in their bombardment reveal a failure to consider the safety of patients and medical personnel, including the inability to provide an effective evacuation order and lack of evidence for a calculated attack. It is further supported by testimonies of healthcare workers and organizations reporting damage to medical infrastructure, ultimately leading to the collapse of the healthcare system in Gaza.

List of 34 Hospitals in Gaza Attacked by Israeli Forces since October 7th

Non-Functional

1. Al-Shifa Hospital

November 3rd, 2023 (airstrike)

November 6th, 2023 (airstrike)

November 10th, 2023 (airstrike)

November 11th, 2023 (shooting)

November 13th, 2023 (shooting)

Navarah an 15th, 2020 (crist)

November 15th, 2023 (raid)

November 18th, 2023 (shooting)

March 18th, 2024 (raid)

March 20th, 2024 (shooting)

March 21st, 2024 (bombing)

Claim: Daniel Hagari (IDF Spokesman) stated army would conduct evacuations of newborns from al-Shifa Hospital,

Refute: Gaza Health Ministry spokesman stated Israel had not provided "any mechanism to get the babies out to a safer hospital."

Refute: Mai al-Kaila, the Palestinian Minister of Health, stated the Israeli army was not evacuating patients, but rather "forcibly evicting the wounded and patients onto the streets, leaving them to face inevitable death."

Refute: The director of Al-Shifa stated Israel's claim to provide incubators to premature babies was false.

Claim: John Kirby, spokesperson for the U.S. National Security Council claimed Hamas and Palestinian Islamic Jihad had "stored weapons" in the hospital. These claims were disputed. (5,6,13)

2. Al-Amal Hospital

```
December 22nd, 2023 (shelling)
January 2nd, 2024
January 3rd, 2024
January 16th, 2024 (shelling)
January 19th, 2024 (shooting)
January 23rd, 2024 (shooting)
January 26th, 2024 (tank fire)
January 28th, 2024 (shooting)
January 29th, 2024 (shooting)
January 30th, 2024 (raid)
January 31st, 2024 (raid)
February 9th, 2024 (shelling)
```

Claim: The Israel Defense Forces (IDF) said "troops are continuing to conduct operational activity in the areas of Al Amal and Al-Qarara, eliminating terrorists and carrying out targeted raids on terrorist infrastructure." (28)

Refute: PRCS said Israeli forces wounded displaced people sheltering at the hospital, who later died.

3. Nasser Medical Complex

December 17th, 2023 (shooting)
January 16th, 2024 (shelling)
January 17th, 2024 (bombing)
January 20th, 2024 (airstrike)
January 22nd, 2024 (raid)
January 25th, 2024 (bombing)
February 7th, 2024 (shooting)
February 8th, 2024 (shooting)
February 9th, 2024 (shooting)
February 10th, 2024 (shooting)
February 11th, 2024 (shooting)
February 12th, 2024 (shooting)
February 13th, 2024 (shooting)
February 14th, 2024 (shooting)

Claim: The IDF claims the hospital was used by Hamas to hold hostages kidnapped from Israel Refute: Israeli forces raided the hospital in a military operation that lasted 10 days, during which they killed dozens of displaced people, medical staff, and patients inside the hospital, and arrested hundreds more, according to the Health Ministry in the enclave. (5)

4. Al-Quds hospital

October 28th, 2023 November 3rd, 2023 (airstrike) November 10th, 2023 November 11th, 2023

Claim: All Israel News reported that a Hamas battalion operating from the hospital ambushed IDF troops, saying that 21 militants were killed whereas the Israelis suffered no casualties. On 13 November, Refute: Palestine Red Crescent Society condemned allegations that Hamas was attacking from the hospital saying the video from the drone only showed them in the street outside the hospital.

5. Indonesian hospital

November 3rd, 2023 November 20th, 2023

Claim: The IDF forces said that it believes the Indonesian Hospital was built on a Hamas tunnel system. Refute: Commentator Taghreed El-Khodary said that Israel convinced the world that al-Shifa Hospital was the headquarters of Hamas because it was the easiest route for them to invade Gaza. (29)

6. International Eye Hospital

October 10th, 2023 (airstrike)

7. The Psychiatric Hospital

November 5th, 2023 (airstrike)

8. Turkish-Palestinian Friendship Hospital

October 30th, 2023 (airstrike)

9. Public Aid Hospital

November 3rd, 2023

10. Sheikh Hamad bin Khalifa al-Thani Hospital

October 15th, 2023 (airstrike)

11. Al-Helu Hospital

November 1st, 2023 November 14th, 2023

12. Al-Rantisi hospital

November 10th, 2023 (siege) November 11th, 2023 (siege)

13. Al-Nasser Pediatric Hospital

November 4th, 2023 November 10th, 2023 January 5th, 2024

14. Moh El Dorra Pediatric Hospital

October 13th, 2023 (white phosphorous)

15. Al-Rimal Health Centre

November 11th, 2023 (airstrike)

16. Al-Wafa Hospital for Specialized Surgery and Medical Rehabilitation

November 17th, 2023 (airstrike)

17. Governmental Eye Hospital

November 10th, 2023

18. Mahdi Maternity Hospital

November 11th, 2023 (airstrike)

19. Patient's Friends Benevolent Society

February 12th, 2024

20. Al Karama Specialized Hospital

October 17th, 2023 (airstrike)

21. Yafa Hospital

December 8th, 2023 (airstrike)

22. Al-Khair Hospital

January 22nd, 2024 (raid)

While the 8 remaining hospitals are partially functional, these centers are unable to provide most medical services due to lack of fuel, power, healthcare workers and damage to medical supplies. These constraints further compound the already significant strain of having to meet the increasing needs of 2.2 million civilians under increasing risk. (17,18)

Partially Functional

23. European Gaza Hospital

February 3rd, 2024 (hostility)

24. Al-Awda Hospital

November 21st, 2023 (strike)

December 1st, 2023 (bombing)

December 9th, 2023 (shooting)

December 11th, 2023 (shooting)

December 14th, 2023 (raid)

December 19th, 2023 (detainment)

December 21st, 2023 (shooting)

January 30th, 2024 (strike)

January 31st, 2024 (shelling)

25. Mohammed Yousef Al-Najjar Hospital

March 28th, 2024 April 3rd, 2024 (strike)

26. Al-Ahli al-Arabi Hospital

October 14th, 2023 (strike) December 18th, 2023 (hostility)

27. Al-Aqsa Martyrs Hospital

January 8th, 2024 January 10th, 2024 January 13th, 2024

28. Kamal Adwan Hospital

November 22nd, 2023 (shooting)

December 3rd, 2023

December 5th, 2023

December 11th, 2023

December 12th, 2023 (raid)

December 14th, 2023 (blockade)

December 16th, 2023 (massacre)

December 23rd, 2023

Claim: Israel claims that the hospital was used to shelter terrorists, arguing that this invalidated the protection provided by the Geneva Conventions.

Refute: The Palestinian Centre for Human Rights (PCHR) says that Israel is in clear violation of destruction to parts of the hospital, as well as the arrest and abuse of many medical staff and displaced people. (3)

29. Al-Helal Emirati Hospital

March 2nd, 2024 (bombing)

30. Beit Hanoun Hospital

October 11th, 2023

31. Al-Sahaba Hospital

December 15th, 2023 (bombing)

32. Kuwait Hospital

February 12th, 2024 (airstrike)

International Committees have yet to address the inadequate justification for deliberately targeting patients, staff workers and the indiscriminate destruction to medical equipment and infrastructure due to unsupported claims.

Minimally Functional

33. Jordan Field Hospital

January 17th, 2024 (shelling) January 20th, 2024 (airstrike)

Claim: Israel denied that it shelled the field hospital in Khan Younis, saying it was engaged in a gunfight with Hamas fighters nearby.

Refute: the Jordanian armed forces denied that this action was a consequence of a clash with resistance factions. It said it "strongly asserts that the deliberate targeting of the Jordanian Field Hospital was part of Israel's consistent approach to targeting hospitals in Gaza." (12)

Result of Attacks

Severe disruptions to healthcare access are a direct result of the ongoing blockade and damage to infrastructure carried out by the Israeli forces. As of March 29th, 2024,

- 24 hospitals are out of service and 2 are minimally functional.
- ~24% of primary health care facilities are functional.
- 33% (8 out of 24) of UNRWA health centers are operational

(Source: oPT Emergency Situation Update, World Health Organization (WHO)) (1)

Disease Outbreaks due to Displacement

Severe overcrowding due to continued displacement in the Gaza strip has caused a major spike for serious epidemics, including respiratory tract infections, hepatitis, lice, acute watery diarrhea, scabies, and other diseases. The ongoing blockade by Israeli forces have severely disrupted the management of medical waste at hospitals, further increasing risk to hazardous materials and infection. Data provided by the World Health Organization (WHO) presents an increase of disease outbreaks present in the Gaza strip, particularly for diarrheal illness and Hepatitis A. Since Mid-October there are a recorded:

- **586,402** cases of respiratory infections
- 81,259 cases of scabies and lice
- 46,195 cases of skin rashes
- 19,117 cases of jaundice (presumed Hepatitis A after samples tested positive)
- 7,037 cases of chickenpox

(Source: oPT Emergency Situation Update, World Health Organization (WHO)) (1)

Destruction to Gaza's healthcare infrastructure has made disease surveillance virtually impossible for global health organizations, posing greater challenges for outbreak prevention. Patients suffering from common medical problems such as pneumonia, bladder or kidney infections, heart attacks, pneumonia, allergic reactions, abdominal infections, strokes, or other non-war related injuries could face death or severe illnesses. Services that were once readily available to Gazans are now extremely difficult to secure under Israel's near siege. (19)

Disruption of access to specific treatments

Cancer

On October 30th, 2023, The destruction of Gaza's only cancer hospital, The Turkish-Palestinian Friendship Hospital, led to the complete collapse of cancer care within the region. Prior to the war, Gaza treated **1800 to 2000** cancer patients per year, of which around 6-8% were children. Currently, only **1-5**% of patients have access to adequate cancer treatment. A ceasefire on Gaza's cancer hospitals is estimated to increase access to cancer care by **19-45%**. (2,14)

Obstetrics

The latest report from UNICEF in March 2024, estimates that **50,000** pregnant women and girls in Gaza risk missing ante-natal care due to giving birth without electricity or medical supplies. Chance of survival has significantly decreased for both mothers and newborns due to staggering rates of malnutrition and improper prenatal and postnatal care. As of current, **15-25%** of pregnant women have access to health facilities with available commodities (MgSO4, antibiotics, uterotonics) for childbirth, but this can drop to as low as **5-15%** without intervention. (14)

Nephrology

According to a recent assessment by Forensic Architecture, the Israeli occupation's evacuation orders in the Gaza Strip resulted in massive displacement and greater restriction to specific treatments including kidney care centers. It is estimated that patient accessibility to hemodialysis will decrease by **35-45%** if attacks against Gaza's hospitals continue. (1,14)

Trauma Injuries

Inability to access trauma centers in a timely manner due to the cessation of functioning hospitals is projected to cause **7,560** deaths within the first 3 months of further escalation. Within 6 months, it is estimated that a total of **15,110** deaths would occur as a result of further destruction on Gaza's remaining trauma centers. (14)

Management of Chronic Conditions

Attacks involving healthcare staff and facilities have rendered outpatient services essentially nonexistent, therefore, exacerbating these conditions and causing preventable deaths secondary to the ongoing attacks to the healthcare system. (14,19)

Remaining Hospitals to Date

Al-Ahli Arab Hospital

As of February 23rd, 2024, Al-Ahli Arab Hospital is the only functioning hospital in the North of Gaza strip. It has continued to provide care for underweight and malnourished children under the Israeli blockade, in addition to other services such as burn treatments and occupational therapy. While the hospital is minimally functioning, operations to adequately treat patients are severely limited by the shortage of fuel and maximum patient capacity. Any attempts by the Israeli forces to further disrupt operations or otherwise render the hospital non-functional could

imply devastating health consequences for all patients of the hospital, and in particular, the thousands of patients and individuals of whom remain in the northern areas of Gaza. (3)

European Gaza Hospital

European Gaza Hospital is one of the last remaining trauma centers to provide partial surgical procedures to patients, and one of the few centers in which humanitarian providers are able to perform surgeries. It is already at maximum capacity due to the influx of patients who sought shelter following the bombardment of Nasser Hospital. (19)

Al-Awda Hospital

Al-Awda Hospital has been subject to several ongoing attacks including indiscriminate shootings and bombardment. Head of the Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology Dr. Adnan Rami reported that pregnant women have been killed in attempts to access the hospital. It is projected that escalation on Gaza's birthing centers, Al-Awda being of the final ones remaining, will result in a **30%** decrease in access to care. (10)

Mohammed Yousef Al-Najjar Hospital

Mohammed Yousef Al-Najjar Hospital is one of the few remaining hospitals that provide limited treatment for Cancer and OBGYN care, as well as serving as a main dialysis center.

Al-Agsa Martyrs Hospital

Al-Aqsa Hospital is the only hospital located in the middle of the Gaza Strip and is a main source for Palestinians seeking refuge. (18)

Jordan Field Hospital

Jordan Field Hospital is one of the last remaining trauma centers to provide partial surgical procedures. It currently also serves as a source of refuge for an influx of displaced Palestinians following continued escalations. (12)

Kuwaiti Hospital

The Kuwaiti Specialized Hospital is a small hospital with an extremely limited capacity. It has been continuously subjected to Israeli incursions and only offers basic medical services and management to date. (25)

Kamal Adwan Hospital

Kamal Adwan remains open to serve over **700,000** people in Northern Gaza, despite heavy bombardment in the area. (15)

Al Sahaba Hospital

Al Sahaba Hospital is functioning very minimally due to ongoing attacks, shelters hundreds of displaced Palestinians, and offers maternity services to the area. As of December, it is functioning with only three doctors able to provide C-sections to patients. (27)

Call To Action

There is a dire need to protect the remaining hospitals that are already at maximum capacity. Consequences of inaction to preserve the remaining operations against Israeli escalation are estimated to cause a total of **19,030** preventable deaths between February and August 2024. (22)

"Allowing this violence to take place has sent a clear message to the world and the international community that the people of Gaza do not have the right to health and critical determinants of health adequate for their existence."

Ms. Tlaleng Mofokeng, Special Rapporteur by the UN Human Rights Council (6)

We call upon international institutions and leaders to prioritize the protection of Gaza's remaining hospitals. We declare the need for Gaza's remaining healthcare facilities to be classified as protected entities under all circumstances without expectation, to prevent further aggression, and devastation brought upon Gaza's fragile healthcare system.

This Joint Statement is supported in solidarity and endorsed by the following organizations:

*	ir	าร	er	t	lo	q	os	h	er	e	*

Sources:

- 1. oPT Emergency Situation Update, World Health Organization (WHO))
- 2. Gaza: Excess deaths could exceed 85 000, researchers predict https://www.bmj.com/content/384/bmj.q509/rr-0
- 3. Update Ahli Arab Hospital (23 February 2024) https://reliefweb.int/report/occupied-palestinian-territory/update-ahli-arab-hospital-23-february-2024
- 4. https://www.cbsnews.com/news/israel-hamas-war-gaza-european-hospital-palestinians/
- 5. Hamas Rejects Israeli Claim over Installations under Al-Shifa Hospital https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2023/10/27/hamas-rejects-israeli-claim-over-installations-under-al-shifa-hospital
- 6. Israel/Gaza: UN experts deplore attacks on Al-Shifa Hospital, urge States to stop the massacre https://www.ohchr.org/en/statements-and-speeches/2024/04/israelgaza-un-experts-deplore-attacks-al-shifa-hospital-urge-states
- 10. Doctors at Al-Awda Hospital in northern Gaza resume life-saving work https://actionaid.org/news/2024/most-our-surgery-done-under-headlights-there-no-electricity-all-doctors-al-awda-hospital
- 11. WHO and partners bring fuel to Al-Shifa, as remaining hospitals in Gaza face growing threats https://www.who.int/news/item/24-01-2024-who-and-partners-bring-fuel-to-al-shifa--as-remaining-hospitals-in-gaza-face-growing-threats

- 12. Jordan accuses Israel of deliberately targeting its Gaza field hospital
- https://www.npr.org/2024/01/19/1225623652/jordan-field-hospital-gaza-israel
- 13. Israel-Gaza war: US says Hamas has command centre under Al-Shifa hospital https://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-67414091
- 14.. https://gaza-projections.org/gaza projections report.pdf
- 15. Kamal Adwan Hospital Siege https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kamal Adwan Hospital siege
- 16. Lives of one million children 'hanging by a thread,' as child health services almost collapse across the Gaza Strip https://www.unicef.org/mena/press-releases/lives-one-million-children-hanging-thread-child-health-services-almost-collapse
- 17. Which Gaza hospitals have been forced to shut down amid Israel's war? https://www.newarab.com/news/which-gaza-hospitals-have-shut-down-amid-israels-war
- 18. How Gaza's Hospitals Became Battlegrounds
- https://www.cnn.com/interactive/2024/01/middleeast/gaza-hospitals-destruction-investigation-intl-cmd/
- 19. Doctors in Gaza hospital "have to prioritise" patients most likely to survive https://www.reuters.com/world/middle-east/doctors-gaza-hospital-have-prioritise-patients-most-likely-survive-2024-02-06/
- 20. Ghassan Abu-Sittah: Israeli attacks on Gaza hospitals are 'monstrous' https://www.newarab.com/news/israel-gaza-hospital-attacks-monstrous-ghassan-abu-sittah
- 21. Turkish-Palestinian Friendship Hospital in Gaza severely damaged from Israeli airstrikes https://www.aa.com.tr/en/middle-east/turkish-palestinian-friendship-hospital-in-gaza-severely-damaged-from-israeli-airstrikes/3037514
- 22. Insecurity Insight, Attacks on Healthcare https://insecurityinsight.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/10/1..-07-x-October-2023-Attacks-on-Health-Care-in-Israel-and-the-oPt.pdf
- 23. Palestinian Human Rights Organizations Condemn the Serious Israeli Violations at Kamal Adwan Hospital in Northern Gaza <a href="https://reliefweb.int/report/occupied-palestinian-territory/palestinian-human-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-kamal-adwan-hospital-northern-gaza-enar-rights-organizations-condemn-serious-israeli-violations-condemn-serious-israeli-
- 24. https://english.news.cn/20231018/dd1d974019cc4a13a0ff8fe20c5547a5/c.html
- 25. https://reliefweb.int/report/occupied-palestinian-territory/hostilities-gaza-strip-and-israel-flash-update-110-enarhe
- 26. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Al-Shifa Hospital siege
- 27. Issue Brief: Attacks on healthcare and Impacts on Physical Rehabilitation https://reliefweb.int/report/occupied-palestinian-territory/issue-brief-attacks-healthcare-and-impacts-physical-rehabilitation-and-mental-health-services-gaza-strip-november-2023
- 28. https://apnews.com/article/israel-hamas-war-news-02-15-2024-d3a25caf6b60fe560e1a31d4f8f6b45e
 29. https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2023/11/20/israel-targets-gazas-indonesian-hospital-here-is-whats-to-know
- 30. Euro-Med Rights Monitor Report https://euromedmonitor.org/en/category/19/Infographic